Group Discussion

Being a Judge

Start with the Larger Goals (Objective Functions)

• What is the purpose of the criminal justice system? What is punishment for?

• More narrowly, what’s the purpose of having a bail system at all?

• What are the criteria you would use if you had to make a decision about whether someone should be released on bail?
Being a Judge
Now narrow down to decision-making about bail:

• What are the criteria you would use if you had to make a decision about whether someone should be released on bail?
Weighing Costs and Benefits

Draw a line down the middle of a piece of paper. On one side, put a plus and the other side put a minus. Brainstorm quietly a set of answers to the following questions. Then share with the group.

• What are the advantages of using an algorithm to make bail determinations?

• What would make you cautious about using a predictive algorithm?
Addressing Potential Concerns

Start by brainstorming individually your answers to the following question. Then share as a group.

• Under what conditions would you feel comfortable with an algorithm making a critical decision like this in your life?

Now identify as a group the three most important conditions.

• How would you make those conditions operational?
Choosing a Fairness Specification

We’ve learned about multiple and reasonable conceptions of fairness: *anti-classification*, *classification parity*, *calibration*, *(lack of)* *disparate impact*.

• If you were employed at Northpointe, what fairness specification would you choose?

• Who should decide the fairness specification?
Group Discussion

Making Decisions

- Who should make the ultimate decision about whether an algorithm should be used?
- How should they make that decision?