Shifting social meanings in the Southern diaspora: The emergence of a ‘country’ style in California

Robert J. Podesva
Stanford University

Language Variation and Change in Diaspora Communities
November 7, 2019
Introduction

Variation studies in context of migration typically focus on *changes in form* induced by contact.

This paper advocates for an approach that additionally attends to *changes in social meaning* that accompany structural change.

Three sociophonetic features of Southern US English in California:

1. PIN-PEN Merger
2. /s/ Retraction
3. Degree of Voicing in /b, d, g/ Closures
Outline

1. Dustbowl Migration and Social Meaning
2. Voices of California Project
3. Case Studies
   • PIN-PEN Merger
   • /s/ Retraction
   • Degree of Voicing in /b, d, g/ Closures
4. Conclusion
Dust Bowl Migration
Dustbowl Migration
We all sound like we’re from somewhere else out here. Many sound country. Many of ‘em sound like they’re from the South. From the-from-the-wherever, but, you hear some. Some they just sound like they come straight out of Oklahoma. Born and raised right here in Bakersfield. Take ‘em up in LA, and they'll swear—Everybody in LA’ll swear, “Where’re you from, man?” “Oh, you’re from Texas?” (laughter) Right here from Bakersfield. So many people perceive Bakersfield as a little hole in the wall.

Bakersfield speech is... Southern country not CA/LA
Social Meaning

The set of inferences that can be drawn based on the use of a variable linguistic form.

form → meaning

HRT → speaker is a Valley Girl
   → speaker is concerned with being understood
   → interaction is generally supportive

(Sharma and Sankaran 2011 and Hall-Lew, Cardoso, and Davies forthcoming offer examples of shifting social meanings in diasporic contexts.)
Approaches to Studying Social Meaning

1. Examining metalinguistic commentary
2. Conducting perception experiments
3. Investigating intraspeaker style shifting
4. Situating variation in discourse
5. Observing meaning in ethnographic context
6. Triangulating meaning through correlations
## Triangulating Social Meaning

### Centralization Index Scores (Martha’s Vineyard)

#### a. Occupation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>(ay)</th>
<th>(aw)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fisherman</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farmers</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### b. Leaving or Staying

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>(ay)</th>
<th>(aw)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Leaving 1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leaving 2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staying 1</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staying 2</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### c. Orientation to Island

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>(ay)</th>
<th>(aw)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Labov (1963)
Orders of Indexicality

linguistic feature  Centralized (ay)  Dust Bowl Speech

\[ \downarrow \]

\[ \downarrow \]

\[ \downarrow \]

\[ \downarrow \]

n\textsuperscript{th} order meaning  Vineyarder  Southern

n+1\textsuperscript{st} order meaning  opposition to mainland  ‘country’


Stanford University
Outline

1. Dustbowl Migration and Social Meaning
2. Voices of California Project
3. Case Studies
   • PIN-PEN Merger
   • /s/ Retraction
   • Degree of Voicing in /b, d, g/ Closures
4. Conclusion
Major English Dialect Areas in North America

Labov, Ash, and Boberg 2006

Stanford University
1. 2010: Merced
2. 2011: Redding
3. 2012: Bakersfield
4. 2014: Sacramento
5. 2016: Salinas
6. 2017: Humboldt County
7. 2018: Redlands
8. 2019: Amador County
Voices of California Project

Goals
• Address dearth of work on non-urban, non-coastal areas of CA
• Capture Californians’ experiences in their own words

Data Collection
• 100+ sociolinguistic interviews, word list, map tasks per site (currently nearly 900)
• Scouting trip to make contacts, understand demography
• Nightly meetings to discuss field observations
• Recruitment via (social) media, snowball sampling

Stanford University
Data Processing

886 Speakers
## Data Processing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Transcription</th>
<th>886 Speakers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Word Lists</td>
<td>886</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interviews</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Stanford University
## Data Processing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>886 Speakers</th>
<th>Word Lists</th>
<th>Interviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transcription</td>
<td>886</td>
<td>348</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alignment</td>
<td>744</td>
<td>223</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Stanford University*
## Data Processing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Word Lists</th>
<th>Interviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transcription</td>
<td>886</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alignment</td>
<td>744</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acoustic Analysis</td>
<td>744</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Outline

1. Dustbowl Migration and Social Meaning
2. Voices of California Project
3. Case Studies
   • PIN-PEN Merger
   • /s/ Retraction
   • Degree of Voicing in /b, d, g/ Closures
4. ‘Country’
5. Conclusion
PIN-PEN Merger


*tin or ten?*
So I showed up at Bedford Middle School in my camo pants and greenish-brownish down jacket. Thankfully, I had the Cali thing going for me - the mystique of the California girl. Then they found out I was really from Texas and said pin instead of pen and tin instead of ten. Teased unmercifully, I finally eliminated any trace of a Southern accent.
PIN-PEN Merger in Social Media

*St. Louis, Missouri:* Truly representative of Americana at its best, *St. Louis* brings out the stars and stripes in its most authentic fashion. Known for its awe-inspiring Gateway Arch, but more for pumping out artists like Chuck Berry and Miles Davis, the city classic in its roots, and its accent is classic in its versatility. Words are full-sounding and a little southern. “To” = “tew”, “friends” = “frinds”, and “ing” sounds a lot more like “eeng.”
PIN-PEN Analysis

- F1 and F2 for all data normalized using Lobanov’s (1971) method

Word list data: PIN N = 1,196 PEN N = 1,204
Interview data: PIN N = 5,439 PEN N = 12,195

- PIN-PEN merger quantified in terms of Euclidean distance between the mean of PIN and the mean of PEN

  Interpretation: greater spectral overlap = shorter distance
PIN-to-PEN Euclidean Distance by Birth Year (Interview Data)
PIN-to-PEN Euclidean Distance by Site and Population (Interview Data)

Population Density
- Black: < 3,600 ppl / sq mile
- Gray: > 6,700 ppl / sq mile
- White: data not available

Stanford University
PIN-PEN by Orientation (Redding Interview Data)

Country-Oriented

Town-Oriented

Stanford University
What is ‘country’?

One of the biggest problems is the laws are made to fit a city, and they don’t fit here, and they try to run it like a city, and it ain’t a city, you know, I mean, and a lot of the laws, you can’t even make ‘em fit here but yet they still want you to go by ‘em. Pretty ridiculous anymore.

San Francisco ain’t Northern California even though they keep callin’ it Northern California.
Northern California

State of Jefferson

Stanford University
PIN-PEN by Political Orientation (Humboldt Word List Data)

Where (23669 rows excluded)

Conservative

Liberal

Stanford University
PIN-PEN merger does not index education (class).
Geenberg (2014)

Trinity County

‘outdoorsy’ – people who “pride themselves on their ability to farm, fish, hunt, ranch, and generally make it on their own”

PIN-PEN merger and DRESS raising/fronting (both features of Southern US English) predicted by outdoorsiness, but not Okie heritage.

PIN-PEN merger does not strongly index ‘Southern’ or ‘Okie’.
Triangulating ‘Country’

Correlates of PIN-PEN merger:
✓ low population density
✓ holding conservative views
✓ being oriented to the country
✗ lower education level (class)
✗ Southern/Okie heritage
Outline

1. Dustbowl Migration and Social Meaning
2. Voices of California Project
3. Case Studies
   - PIN-PEN Merger
   - /s/ Retraction
   - Degree of Voicing in /b, d, g/ Closures
4. Conclusion
Retracted /s/

\[
dance \quad sand \quad sat \quad sad
\]

‘Southern’ and ‘country’
• Campbell-Kibler (2011) – retracted /s/ evaluated as Southern, country

Gender, sexuality, class
• Retracted /s/ also a resource for constructing gender and sexuality in class-specific ways (e.g., Stuart-Smith 2007, Levon and Holmes-Elliott 2013, Podesva and Van Hofwegen 2016, Zimman 2017)

Stanford University
/s/ Analysis

**FRONTED**

\[
\text{see}
\]

COG (Hz) = 9008

**RETRACTED**

\[
\text{seven}
\]

COG (Hz) = 2892

Word list data: N = 2,414

Stanford University
/s/ COG by Birth Year (Word List Data)
by Site and Population
(Word List Data)

Population Density
- < 3,600 ppl / sq mile
- > 6,700 ppl / sq mile
- data not available
/s/ COG by Orientation (Humboldt County Word List Data)
Graph Builder

Graph showing COG (Hz) by Education level:
- (some) high school
- some college
- college
- grad school

Where (1493 rows excluded)

Retracted /s/ COG does not index education (class).

Stanford University
Triangulating ‘Country’

Correlates of /s/ retraction:
✓ low population density
✓ being oriented to the country (male speakers)
✗ lower education level (class)
Outline

1. Dustbowl Migration and Social Meaning
2. Voices of California Project
3. Case Studies
   • PIN-PEN Merger
   • /s/ Retraction
   • Degree of Voicing in /b, d, g/ Closures
4. Conclusion
Strongly Voiced Stop Closures

they [b]uy

Stanford University
Strongly Voiced Stops as ‘Southern’

Jaciewicz, Fox, and Lyle (2009: 324)

Women (51-65 years old) from North Carolina (N=10) exhibit greater degree of closure voicing for word-initial /b/ than women from Wisconsin (N=10) in lab speech.
Voiced Stop Analysis

\[ \text{vowel_to_closure_intensity} = \text{mean intensity of vowel} - \text{mean intensity of closure} \]

Interpretation: lower numbers = greater voicing

(adapted from Stoel-Gammon et al. 1994, Jongman et al. 1985)

Hand-annotated data:

- 62 speakers, diverse in age, gender
- 3 field sites: BAK, MER, RED
- 15 tokens/speaker for each of /b, d, g/
- N = 2,700
Degree of Closure Voicing by Orientation (Interview Data)

more strongly voiced closure

![Graph showing the degree of vowel to closure intensity (vowel to closure) by country and town.]

Stanford University
Social Factors with No Observed Effect

Age
Variation in degree of stop voicing reflects stable variation.

Site
All 3 communities were small and sparsely populated; predict weaker closure voicing in larger communities.

Education
Degree of stop voicing does not straightforwardly correlate with class.
Triangulating ‘Country’

Correlates of strongly voiced stop closures:

❓ low population density
✔ being oriented to the country
✗ lower education level (class)
Outline

1. Dustbowl Migration and Social Meaning
2. Voices of California Project
3. Case Studies
   • PIN-PEN Merger
   • /s/ Retraction
   • Degree of Voicing in /b, d, g/ Closures
4. Conclusion
Conclusion

Features that once indexed ‘Southern’ have come to mean ‘country’, a shift in social meaning precipitated by a contact situation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feature</th>
<th>PIN-PEN merger</th>
<th>/s/ retraction</th>
<th>stop voicing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Country orientation</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low population density</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conservative politics</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower education level (class)</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>×</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southern/Okie heritage</td>
<td>×</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Stanford University
Why Center Meaning?

Social meaning can provide explanations for why individuals diverge from expected patterns.

To offer more precise accounts.

• Previous work (Hall-Lew and Stephens 2012, Campbell-Kibler 2011, Podesva and Van Hofwegen 2016) has taken for granted the tight connection between Southern identity and country ways of being.
• But ‘Southern’ can be productively disentangled from ‘country’
Thank you!

Eva Kuske

Stanford University and the Richard Karp Foundation

Voices of California Project Interviewees and Researchers