Today’s Lecture

1. Uber/Lyft: who has power?
2. What is power?
3. Who has the power to build technology?
4. Who has the power to regulate technology?
Imagine this:

It’s Saturday night. You want to get from Stanford to San Francisco for a big night out.

A Lyft will cost $38.97 and is 8 minutes away. You are matched with M., who has 4.9 stars.

12 minutes later you get into the Lyft.

You hit traffic and get into San Francisco 15 minutes later than expected.

You tip your driver one dollar and give them 4 stars for being late.

Your driver makes $12 on an hour long trip.
Who has power in this situation?

(Discuss with your neighbor for 5 minutes)
Who has power in the Uber situation?

**You:** You can choose which company you want to use, the start and end location, what kind of car you want, how much to tip the driver, how high to rank them, whether you want them to speak or not, etc.

**Your Driver:** They have the power to get you from A to B. They can also accept/reject rides and report and rate riders.

**Uber Workers:** They build the algorithm that sets the price, matches drivers with riders, tracks the drivers, determines how much drivers make.

**Uber Executives:** They decide how much drivers should get paid, what metrics the engineers should optimize for, what policy positions to take. They determine salary and benefits for employees and drivers.

**The Investors:** Uber relies on investment money, so investors can push change at Uber in order to make returns. [The board did just this in firing founder Travis Kalanick]

**California:** State law defines how Uber drivers should be classified / what laws should apply to them, e.g. they minimum wage limits, hear cases on discrimination, etc.

**Society:** The unequal and structural distribution of power across class, race, and gender affects how much power individuals have across these domains.
Today’s Lecture

1. Uber: who has power?
2. What is power?
3. Who has the power to build technology?
4. Who has the power to regulate technology?
What is Power?

Basic idea: power is the capacity to get people to do things (they otherwise would not do)
- A has power if A can get B to do something that B would not otherwise do.

But power has multiple forms
- Why? A can be a person, a group, a law, norm, or structure.
- Or a computational system! An algorithm
- In addition: Power can be wielded in different ways. A has multiple strategies to get B to do something.

Why do we want a concept of power?
- So we can properly evaluate when power is legitimate or justified
- So we can seek to hold agents responsible for abuses of power
- Power is connected to responsibility and accountability
Spiderman Principle

“With Great Power Comes Great Responsibility”

Image generated by Rob Reich via DALL-E: “Graphic art of a tech worker dressed as Spiderman”
“Power tends to corrupt, and absolute power corrupts absolutely.”

“Great men are almost always bad men, even when they exercise influence and not authority.”

Acton, 1887
Four Forms of Power (Lukes/Hayward)

1:1 Power-over

The power of A over B to get B to do something (that B would not otherwise do).

Agenda-setting Power

Power to determine choice sets or agendas.

Structural Power

Power exercised by institutions, laws, policy, collective organizations.

Ideological power

Power to shape and change people’s preferences and ideas, (perhaps against their own self-interest)
Another example: Recruitment at Stanford

Every year, many Stanford students go through on-campus recruitment for internships and jobs.

Using the four levels of power (individual, agenda, structural, ideological), how can we think about who has power in job recruitment?
Power-Over

- **Recruiter** has power to move student to next round / hire them
- **Student** has agency to choose which job to apply to
- **Student** has power to accept/reject job offer

Image: Flickr, CC BY-NC-ND 2.0
Agenda-setting power

- **Company** determines how many / what type of candidate they want.

- **Stanford** determines which companies can recruit on campus (it can cost ~10k for companies to have a table at on campus recruitment fairs)

- **Social campaigns** + educational initiatives determine what criteria students are thinking about when applying to jobs (money, ethics, etc)

Images: Screenshot from https://forum.stanford.edu/ on 1/24/23; Screenshot from melissa “cancelled student debt” byrne on https://twitter.com/mcbyrne/status/1536115028738310147
Structural Power

- **Lack of resources and limited social safety net** forces most people to work a job to have access to food, shelter, and healthcare.

- **State policy** determines things like whether people have student loans they need to pay off, how jobs are classified/protected, salary transparency, etc.
Ideological Power

- “Prestige” of high-paying jobs might come at cost of mental health, work-life balance, personal ethics, etc.
- Jobs assigned on the basis of merit/talent/desert.
- Q: do we deserve our talents?
Algorithmic Power (on social media platforms)

Power Over
content moderation; deplatforming

Agenda-Setting Power
option-sets (e.g., 280 characters, quote tweet and retweet)

Structural Power
optimizing for engagement & attention; surveillance capitalism

Ideological Power
Algorithms to Live By (optimize your life)
What type of power do algorithms have?

“Predictive systems tend to **preserve structural advantages and disadvantages.**

Predictive systems tend to operate within existing institutions. When such institutions perpetuate inequality due to structural factors, predictive systems will only reify those effects, absent explicit intervention. Predictive systems tend to inherit structural discrimination because the objective functions used in predictive models usually reflect the incentives of the organizations deploying them.”

Here’s What Happens When an Algorithm Determines Your Work Schedule

Companies have promised to improve automated systems that dictate work shifts. They’re still making workers miserable.

- Makes it hard for workers to make plans for family, health, etc.
- Inconsistent hours worked = unreliable pay
- Associated with worse sleep and higher rates of depression
- Values at stake:
  - Self-actualization
  - Autonomy
  - Self-respect
  - Community belonging

Today’s Lecture

1. Uber: who has power?
2. What is power?
3. **Who has the power to build technology?**
4. Who has the power to regulate technology?

- **Builders** → build physical infrastructure (e.g., cables)
- **Factory Workers** → collect and process raw materials (e.g., minerals) to build technology, work in factories, perform deliveries, maintain data centers
- **Gig Workers** → label data for ML applications / large models, drive cars/do key tasks assigned to them by platform
- **Engineers** → develop technical infrastructure, software, etc. for tech platforms
- **Designers** → develop front-end interface
- **Product Managers** → coordinate engineers and project teams
- **Executives** → set goals for what kind of tech to build
- **Investors** → direct company to make returns on their investments
- **Educators** → teach skills to tech workers
- **Customers** → buy tech products
- **Users** → use tech products (which in turn may use their data)
- **Students** → future tech workers
A Historical View of CS Enrollment at Stanford

CS major declarations
A Slightly More Well-Known Graph

NASDAQ composite index
The Obvious Correlation

- Normalize both graphs by 1998 values
  - Adjust for a one year lag time in declarations

Correlation = 0.61

CS major declarations

NASDAQ composite index
What Happened in 2003?

By 2003, … sensational news stories appeared about a supposedly horrific loss of these [computer programming] jobs [due to offshoring].

-- The Washington Times, June 6, 2004

Correlation up to 2003 = 0.88
Top 5 majors in 1995
1. Bio Sciences
2. Human Biology
3. Economics
4. Psychology
5. English

By 2012, CS became largest major at Stanford

In 2008-09 new CS curriculum went into effect

Declarations in 2022 are **4.8 times** the number in 2007

The Times They Are A-Changin'
A Broader Trend

Figure B2. Newly Declared Undergraduate Majors: CS, CE, and I (beginning in 2008)
CRA Taulbee Survey 2021

Declarations in 2021 are **3 times** the figure in 2007
• Start with broad appeal to students
  – Maximize student exposure to the field
  – “If a student never takes their first CS class, they won’t be a CS major”

---Owen Astrachan, Duke University
In Oct. 2019, Stanford had ~16,500 students, of which ~7000 were undergrads.

In 2019-20, CS taught equivalent of 5.8 units to every student or 13.6 units to every undergrad at Stanford.
Who Are We Reaching?

Percent UGs enrolled in CS 101, 105, 106*, or 107, by graduation cohort

PERCENT ENROLLED

52% 63% 65% 67% 76% 75% 80% 83% 86% 88% 80% 81% 80% 81% 80% 81% 80% 81% 80% 81%

37% 38% 41% 38% 47% 47% 57% 60% 63% 65% 63% 61% 53% 53% 48% 53% 53% 53% 53% 53%

29% 32% 34% 33% 47% 52% 57% 60% 63% 65% 63% 61% 53% 53% 48% 53% 53% 53% 53% 53%

21% 20% 21% 20% 24% 26% 31% 35% 34% 31% 26% 25% 26% 31% 35% 34% 31% 35% 34% 31%

13% 12% 13% 13% 15% 18% 20% 25% 26% 26% 25% 26% 26% 25% 26% 26% 25% 26% 26% 25%

0% 10% 20% 30% 40% 50% 60% 70% 80% 90% 100%


GRADUATING CLASS COHORT

PERCENT ENROLLED

GRADUATING CLASS COHORT

CS 101, 105, 106*, or 107
CS 106 A, B, or X
CS 106 A
CS 106 B or X
Percent CS 107
Female CS Declarees in 2022
Stanford: 30%
Top 160 CS departments: 22%
Demographics at Stanford: Race (Percentage)

- Native American/Alaska Native: 0.0%
- Black/African American: 5.0%
- Hispanic/Latino: 10.0%
- Hawaiian/Pacific Islander: 15.0%
- Asian: 20.0%
- White: 25.0%
- Two or more, not Hispanic/Latino: 30.0%
- International/Nonresident: 35.0%
- Unknown/Decline to state: 40.0%
- CS majors: 45.0%

2020 Data
Demographic Trends at Stanford

BS CS number of degrees awarded

Source: Department of Education, Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System, 2021
Demographic Trends at Stanford

BS CS percentage of degrees awarded

Source: Department of Education, Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System, 2021
An Interesting Experiment

- Given enormous demand for CS education, many universities are capping the number CS majors
  - Create barriers (e.g., min. GPA) to declare CS as major
  - Such barriers disproportionately impact women and underrepresented groups (based on less exposure to computing prior to college)

- So how should access to major be determined?
  - Univ. of Washington: top $N$ students by GPA in intro CS/Math courses
  - UC San Diego (major changes): by lottery

- Which do you think is more fair?
- Which do you wished was used at the school you attended?

- Side note: Stanford CS is committed to not instituting a cap on the size of the CS major and allowing anyone to declare
High-tech Labor Force Demographics in 2022

- **Race:**
  - White: 62%
  - Asian: 20%
  - Hispanic and Latino: 8%
  - Black: 7%

- **Gender:**
  - Male: 73.3%
  - Female: 26.7%

Diversity in Industry

As of May [2020], Google reported that 5.9% of its employees and contractors are Latino and 3.7% are Black — [this lack of diversity] extends up through the ranks of top executives, entrepreneurs who found companies, and venture capitalists who invest in startups.

... 

Even the graduating class of computer science majors at Stanford, Silicon Valley’s elite training ground, is more diverse than the companies just down the road from campus.

Source: Sam Dean and Johana Bhuiyan, Los Angeles Time, June 24, 2020
Downstream Effects

- Who has technology skills impacts:
  - Who gets high-tech jobs
    - High pay, stock options, prestige, network
  - What technology gets built
  - Who intended users of technology are

Reading: *Design Justice* by Sasha Costanza-Chock provides more
Escape locally
Rent your own private pool by the hour.

Where at?
Los Angeles, CA

When?
Whenever

Find pools near me
Tech Culture

- Who is technology built for?
  - Often reflects demographics and socio-economics of those who build it
  - But there is greater equalization with greater adoption

Source: https://khoros.com/resources/social-media-demographics-guide
Who Gets Funded

"That correlates more with any other success factor that I’ve seen in the world’s greatest entrepreneurs. If you look at Bezos, or Andreessen, David Filo, the founders of Google, they all seem to be **white, male, nerds** who’ve dropped out of Harvard or Stanford and they absolutely have no social life"

-- John Doerr
(at National Venture Capital Association meeting in 2008)

What That Means for Founder Demographics

"We close out the decade [2019] with 20 percent of global startups raising their first funding round in 2019 having a female founder.

Source: Gené Teare, EoY 2019 Diversity Report: 20 Percent Of Newly Funded Startups In 2019 Have A Female Founder, CrunchBase News, January 21, 2020

"In the tech community [in 2020], venture capital firms acknowledged the problem — less than 1% of founders who receive venture funding are Black, despite making up over 13% of the US population.

Source: Hallo Research: Black Founder Funding Q3 2020
https://medium.com/halloapp/hallo-research-black-founder-funding-cef159448b1e
Downstream Effects

- Who makes decisions about capital allocation impacts:
  - What companies get founded
    - Who has power in those companies
  - Who gets access to capital
    - What companies live and die
  - Who allocates capital in the future
Diversity Matters

• What do these technology scholars have in common?
  • They are leaders in showing how technology can lead to discrimination
  • Their personal experiences were a driving force in their research

• Their scholarship has produced:
  • Significant rethinking of how technology is evaluated
  • Testimony before Congress
  • Changes in tech business practices
  • Greater awareness of these issues throughout the industry
Today’s Lecture

1. Uber: who has power?
2. What is power?
3. Who has the power to build technology?
4. Who has the power to regulate technology?
“I want to create an oasis from regulation in the broadband world, so that any company, using any technology, will have incentives to deploy broadband in an unregulated or significantly deregulated environment.”

-- William Kennard, FCC Chairman, 1999
The regulatory landscape sets the rules of the game.
Earn up to $85k/year in fares driving in Seattle with UberX! Apply now and start making some serious cash!

Sign Up Now!
Sign up for a partner account with Uber to become a partner driver.

PARTNERS.UBER.COM  Sign Up
Holes in the regulatory landscape also create opportunities for disruption and innovation, as well as distributive consequences.
What’s Going on Here?

“We have to understand these companies not as technology companies, but as taxi companies using digital platforms.”

“Ride hailing was not going to be about angry immigrant men [anymore].”

The key ingredients: treat workers as independent contractors, accumulate customers via artificially low prices (subsidized by VC), optimize worker labor

Image: Courtesy of Veena Dubal
Hispanic, Black and Asian Americans are more likely than White Americans to have ever earned money doing any online gig platform work

% of U.S. adults who have ever earned money by doing any gig platform work

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>U.S. adults</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian*</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Asian adults were interviewed in English only.
Note: White, Black and Asian adults include those who report being only one race and are not Hispanic. Hispanics are of any race.
Among current or recent gig platform workers, about three-in-ten say it’s been their main job over past year; majorities rely on this income to meet basic needs

Among gig platform workers who have earned money in the past 12 months on these online platforms, % who say the following:

OVER THE PAST TWELVE MONTHS...

This type of work has generally been their ...

- Main Job 31
- Side Job 68
- DK/Ref 1

They have spent ___ doing these jobs in a typical week, including the time they spent waiting for assignments

- Less than 10 hours: 41%
- 10-30 hours: 29%
- More than 30 hours: 8%
- They don’t do these jobs most weeks: 23%

Image: Pew
Comparison of workplace legal protections for employees and for independent contractors in the United States

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Labor standard</th>
<th>Employee</th>
<th>Independent contractor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Minimum wage</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overtime pay</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment insurance</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workers’ compensation</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paid sick days</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paid family leave</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health and safety protections</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right to a union</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discrimination and sexual harassment protections</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** EPI analysis of federal and state laws. Employees receive these protections in places where they are statutorily prescribed.

Economic Policy Institute
The Impact of COVID-19 on California Gig Workers

The UCLA Labor Center worked with the Service Employees International Union – United Healthcare Workers West to conduct 302 surveys of gig workers in companies such as Uber and Instacart. Take a look at the major findings of this study.

- 8/10 gig workers could not cover their household expenses with their current pay.
- 3/4 felt their companies were doing little to nothing to protect them.
- 1/2 did not receive PPE from their companies, and 95% claimed they would not be reimbursed for purchasing PPE.
- 3/4 said gig work was their primary source of income.
- 1/2 said they had to stop working because of the COVID-19 pandemic.
- 7/10 said the COVID-19 pandemic led to reduced hours.

Regulation

Definition: Regulation is the management of complex systems according to rules or principles.

1. A rule or directive made and maintained by an authority. "planning regulations"

2. The action or process of regulating or being regulated. "the regulation of financial markets"
Why Do We Have The Regulatory Frameworks We Do?

1. They were designed for another era and haven’t been updated.
2. The problems that we need to solve are hard and no one has any good ideas about how to solve them.
3. The problems that we need to solve are hard, people disagree about how to solve them, and what we have is the only acceptable compromise.
4. Someone is benefiting from the status quo and they are more powerful than those who are harmed.
What does it mean to govern new technologies? It requires thinking about:

- Preferences
- Organized interests
- Aggregating Preferences
- Decision-making
- Implementation
Three Dimensions of Structural Power

1. **Who makes decisions?**
2. Who has influence on those who make decisions?
3. What are the rules that govern when structural power can be exercised?
As does the median net worth

Median average net worth of the 113th Congress versus median worth of American households in three brackets.

SOURCE: CENTER FOR RESPONSIVE POLITICS, CENSUS BUREAU

Image: The Washington Post
Growing racial and ethnic diversity in Congress

Number of non-White House and Senate members by race/ethnicity

Note: Nonvoting delegates and commissioners are excluded. Figures for the 117th Congress are as of Jan. 26, 2021. Asian Americans include Pacific Islanders, and Hispanics are of any race. Members who have more than one racial or ethnic identity for the above groups are counted in each applicable group.

Source: Congressional Research Service, CQ Roll Call, Brookings Institution.
“As one of just three members of Congress with a computer science degree, I am enthralled by A.I. and excited about the incredible ways it will continue to advance society. And as a member of Congress, I am freaked out by A.I.,” writes @tedlieu.
Three Dimensions of Structural Power

1. Who makes decisions?
2. **Who has influence on those who make decisions?**
3. What are the rules that govern when structural power can be exercised?
December 21, 1993:

Democratic National Committee receives $90,000 in contributions from four telecoms companies.
2020 Election Spending Highest Ever Recorded

Total spending on the U.S. congressional and presidential elections (in billion U.S. dollars)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Spending by Democrats</th>
<th>Spending by Republicans</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2020*</td>
<td>10.9</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* All filings available as of Oct 25, 2020
Includes spending by presidential candidates, congressional candidates, parties and outside spending. Adjusted for inflation.
Source: Opensecrets.org
Big Tech Goes Big on Lobbying Efforts

Highest lobbying spending in the tech industry in the U.S. in 2021

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Company</th>
<th>Annual Change</th>
<th>Lobbying Spending</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FACEBOOK</td>
<td>+2%</td>
<td>$20.1m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amazon</td>
<td>+8%</td>
<td>$19.3m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Microsoft</td>
<td>+8%</td>
<td>$10.2m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Google</td>
<td>+7%</td>
<td>$9.5m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oracle</td>
<td>+12%</td>
<td>$9.1m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualcomm</td>
<td>+15%</td>
<td>$9.1m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Netflix</td>
<td>+37%</td>
<td>$6.7m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apple</td>
<td>-3%</td>
<td>$6.5m</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Image: Wikimedia Commons, CC BY 2.0
● “Discursive capture” – narrowing of the range of policy options considered appropriate by regulators

e.g. “free from government control”
“essential American export”
“solving today’s policy challenges”
“cementing U.S. global dominance”

● Tech industry exercising “ideological power”
Revolving door between the tech industry and government

Ex: since 2017, Google has hired 197 U.S. officials

Trade-off: Need for tech expertise in government / need for policy expertise in tech V.S lobbying/bribes

Ex-Google CEO Eric Schmidt’s new investment fund deepens his ties to national security interests

America’s Frontier Fund exemplifies the revolving door between the tech industry and government.
Three Dimensions of Structural Power

1. Who makes decisions?
2. Who has influence on those who make decisions?
3. What are the rules that govern when structural power can be exercised?
Two Deeper Impediments to Change

The costs of change are **concentrated**, while the benefits are **diffuse**. This stands in the way of effective collective action.

Many of these companies operate across a variety of regulatory settings – localities, states, national borders. **Coordinating** regulatory action is difficult, making it challenging to influence companies’ behavior.
Assemblywoman Lorena Gonzalez
Stanford class of 1993

Sees law as a tool to expand rights
of workers, women, immigrants

“I come from a perspective of
conflict is good … You actually
get change out of conflict. A
polite society ensures the
status quo.”

• In 2019, Gonzalez introduced and
  passed AB5 to reclassify many gig
  workers as employees rather than
  independent contractors
• 11 months later: Became a ballot
  measure, Prop 22
• Tech companies spent >$200mn on
  “Yes on 22” campaign, most ever in
  state history
California Proposition 22 Election Results: Define App-Based Drivers as Contractors

Calif. Statewide Results ›

App-based drivers, such as for Uber or Lyft, would be considered independent contractors, not employees, overriding a 2019 assembly bill on the matter.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Answer</th>
<th>Votes</th>
<th>Pct.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>7,212,842</td>
<td>58.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>5,121,711</td>
<td>41.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total reported</td>
<td>12,334,553</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How DoorDash and Postmates Make an Already Dangerous Job Worse

The day-to-day realities of a gig economy driver for DoorDash and Postmates: 12-hour days, bad tips, customer abuse, and parking tickets

by Saru Jayaraman | Dec 16, 2021, 9:57 am EST

If you buy something from an Eater link, Vox Media may earn a commission. See our ethics policy.

In 2013, Saru Jayaraman founded One Fair Wage to put an end to the tipped minimum wage, which, One Fair Wage has found, perpetuates racial and gender disparities in the hospitality industry. Those disparities only worsened during the pandemic, as restaurants closed and the prospect of earning a living from tips became even more precarious.

With her newest book One Fair Wage: Ending Subminimum Pay in America, published in the fall of 2021, Jayaraman furthers the movement. With each
Proposition 22 as Racial Wage Code

“a new way to calculate wages that deprives workers of the minimum wage, deprives them of overtime, deprives them of any predictability of income, and does so legally.”

“it only applies to a population of people right now that is highly racialized”

“in California...something like 70% of Lyft’s workforce are people of color and immigrants”

“a majority subordinated racial minority workforce for whom the law is, all of a sudden, completely different.”
One explanation for Prop 22: Racism

“If the state is targeting these people, then the state is not going to be interested in regulating their work…”

“If they are already people.. that the state looks at as potential security threats, or as unimportant, or as threats to our social and political landscape, these aren't going to be the kind of people that regulators stick their neck out for.”

“...I fully believe that that is a huge aspect of the reticence to regulate this field.”

Image: Courtesy of Veena Dubal
What does get passed in the U.S.?

- **Digital Millennium Copyright Act (1998)**
  - Enhanced protections for copyrighted works on the internet
- **Children’s Internet Protection Act (2000)**
  - Limit children’s access to obscene or harmful content
- **Illinois Biometric Privacy Act (2008)**
  - Regulate collection of biometric identifiers by private industry
- **JOBS Act (2012)**
  - Enable start-ups to grow larger and stay private w/o mandatory disclosures
- **California Consumer Privacy Act (2018, 2020)**
  - Enhanced privacy protections, enforcement mechanisms
- **No national legislation on net neutrality, privacy, antitrust, etc.**