Estimating and Simulating a SIRD Model of COVID-19 for Many Countries, States, and Cities

Jesús Fernández-Villaverde and Chad Jones

Extended results for Brazil
Based on data through October 9, 2020
Outline of Slides

- Basic data from Johns Hopkins CSSE (raw and smoothed)
- Brief summary of the model
- Baseline results ($\delta = 1.0\%, \gamma = 0.2, \theta = 0.1$)
- Simulation of re-opening – possibilities for raising $R_0$
- Results with alternative parameter values:
  - Lower mortality rate, $\delta = 0.8\%$
  - Higher mortality rate, $\delta = 1.2\%$
  - Infections last longer, $\gamma = 0.15$
  - Cases resolve more quickly, $\theta = 0.2$
  - Cases resolve more slowly, $\theta = 0.07$
- Data underlying estimates of $R_0(t)$
Underlying data from Johns Hopkins CSSE

- Raw data
- Smoothed = 7 day centered moving average
- No “excess deaths” correction (change as of Aug 6 run)
Brazil: Daily Deaths per Million People

Daily deaths per million people in Brazil from April to October 2020.
Brazil: Daily Deaths per Million People (Smoothed)
Brief Summary of Model

- See the paper for a full exposition
- A 5-state SIRDC model with a time-varying $R_0$

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parameter</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$\delta$</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
<td>Mortality rate from infections (IFR)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\gamma$</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>Rate at which people stop being infectious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\theta$</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>Rate at which cases (post-infection) resolve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\alpha$</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>Rate at which $R_0(t)$ decays with daily deaths</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$R_0$</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>Initial base reproduction rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$R_0(t)$</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>Base reproduction rate at date $t \ (\beta_t/\gamma)$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Estimates of Time-Varying $R_0$

– Inferred from daily deaths, and
– the change in daily deaths, and
– the change in (the change in daily deaths)
(see end of slide deck for this data)
Brazil: Estimates of $R_0(t)$

Brazil

$\delta = 0.010 \quad \theta = 0.10 \quad \gamma = 0.20$
Brazil: Percent Currently Infectious

Peak I/N = 0.25%  Final I/N = 0.15%  δ = 0.010  θ = 0.10  γ = 0.20
Brazil: Growth Rate of Daily Deaths over Past Week (percent)

\[
\text{Brazil} \\
\delta = 0.010 \quad \theta = 0.10 \quad \gamma = 0.20
\]
Notes on Interpreting Results
Guide to Graphs

• **Warning:** Results are often very uncertain; this can be seen by comparing across multiple graphs. See the original paper.

• 7 days of forecasts: Rainbow color order!
  ROY-G-BIV (old to new, low to high)
  - Black = current
  - Red = oldest, Orange = second oldest, Yellow = third oldest...
  - Violet (purple) = one day earlier

• For robustness graphs, same idea
  - Black = baseline (e.g. $\delta = 1.0\%$)
  - Red = lowest parameter value (e.g. $\delta = 0.8\%$)
  - Green = highest parameter value (e.g. $\delta = 1.2\%$)
How does $R_0$ change over time?

- Inferred from death data when we have it.
- For future, two approaches:
  
  1. Alternatively, we fit this equation:

    $$\log R_0(t) = a_0 - \alpha(Daily \ Deaths)$$

    \[\Rightarrow \alpha \approx .05\]

    \(R_0 \text{ declines by 5 percent for each new daily death, or rises by 5 percent when daily deaths decline}\)

- Robustness: Assume $R_0(t) =$ final empirical value. Constant in future, so no $\alpha$ adjustment $\rightarrow \alpha = 0$
Repeated “Forecasts” from the past 7 days of data

– After peak, forecasts settle down.
– Before that, very noisy!
– If the region has not peaked, do not trust
– With $\alpha = .05$ (see robustness section for $\alpha = 0$)
Brazil (7 days): Daily Deaths per Million People ($\alpha = 0.05$)

Brazil

$R_0=1.3/1.1/1.1$  $\delta = 0.010$  $\alpha=0.05$  $\theta=0.1$  $\%$Infect$=7/8/10$

DATA THROUGH 09-OCT-2020
Brazil (7 days): Cumulative Deaths per Million (Future, $\alpha = .05$)

Brazil

$R_0 = 1.3/1.1/1.1$  \( \delta = 0.010 \)  \( \alpha = 0.05 \)  \( \theta = 0.1 \)  \( \% \text{Infect} = 7/8/10 \)

DATA THROUGH 09-OCT-2020
Brazil (7 days): Cumulative Deaths per Million, Log Scale ($\alpha = 0.05$)

Brazil

$R_0 = 1.3/1.1/1.1$  $\delta = 0.010$  $\alpha = 0.05$  $\theta = 0.1$  $\%$Infect = 7/8/10

New York City

Italy
Robustness to Mortality Rate, $\delta$
Brazil: Cumulative Deaths per Million ($\delta = .01/.008/.012$)

Brazil

$R_0 = 1.3/1.1/1.1 \quad \delta = 0.010 \quad \alpha = 0.05 \quad \theta = 0.1 \quad \%\text{Infect} = 7/8/10$

DATA THROUGH 09-OCT-2020
Brazil: Daily Deaths per Million People ($\delta = 0.01/0.008/0.012$)

Brazil

$R_0 = 1.3/1.1/1.1$  $\delta = 0.010$  $\alpha = 0.05$  $\theta = 0.1$  %Infect = 7/8/10

DATA THROUGH 09-OCT-2020
Brazil: Cumulative Deaths per Million ($\delta = .01/.008/.012$)

Brazil

$R_0 = 1.3/1.1/1.1 \quad \delta = 0.010 \quad \alpha = 0.05 \quad \theta = 0.1 \quad \%\text{Infect} = 7/8/10$

DATA THROUGH 09-OCT-2020
Reopening and Herd Immunity

– **Black**: assumes $R_0(today)$ remains in place forever
– **Red**: assumes $R_0(suppress) = 1/s(today)$
– **Green**: we move 25% of the way from $R_0(today)$ back to initial $R_0 = “normal”$
– **Purple**: we move 50% of the way from $R_0(today)$ back to initial $R_0 = “normal”$

**NOTE**: Lines often cover each other up
Brazil: Re-Opening ($\alpha = .05$)

Brazil

$R_0(t)=1.1$, $R_0(\text{suppress})=1.1$, $R_0(25/50)=1.3/1.5$, $\delta = 0.010$, $\alpha=0.05$

(Light bars = New York City, for comparison)
Brazil: Re-Opening ($\alpha = 0$)

Brazil

$R_0(t) = 1.0$, $R_0(\text{suppress}) = 1.1$, $R_0(25/50) = 1.3/1.5$, $\delta = 0.010$, $\alpha = 0.00$

(Light bars = New York City, for comparison)
Results for alternative parameter values
Brazil (7 days): Daily Deaths per Million People ($\alpha = 0$)

DATA THROUGH 09-OCT-2020

Brazil

$R_0 = 1.3/1.0/1.0$  $\delta = 0.010$  $\alpha = 0.00$  $\theta = 0.1$  $\%$Infect = 7/8/9
Brazil (7 days): Cumulative Deaths per Million (Future, $\alpha = 0$)

Brazil

$R_0 = 1.3/1.0/1.0$  $\delta = 0.010$  $\alpha = 0.00$  $\theta = 0.1$  $\%$Infect = 7/8/9

DATA THROUGH 09-OCT-2020
Brazil (7 days): Cumulative Deaths per Million, Log Scale ($\alpha = 0$)

Brazil

$R_0 = 1.3/1.0/1.0 \quad \delta = 0.010 \quad \alpha = 0.00 \quad \theta = 0.1 \quad \%\text{Infect} = 7/8/9$

New York City

Italy
Brazil: Daily Deaths per Million People ($\delta = 0.8\%$)

Brazil

$R_0=1.3/1.1/1.1$  $\delta = 0.008$  $\theta=0.1$  $\gamma=0.2$  $\%Infect=9/10/13$
Brazil: Cumulative Deaths per Million ($\delta = 0.8\%$)

Brazil

$R_0=1.3/1.1/1.1$  $\delta = 0.008$  $\theta=0.1$  $\gamma=0.2$  $\%$Infect$=9/10/13$
Brazil: Daily Deaths per Million People ($\delta = 1.2\%$)

Brazil

$R_0 = 1.3/1.0/1.1$  $\delta = 0.012$  $\theta = 0.1$  $\gamma = 0.2$  $\%$Infect = 6/7/9
Brazil: Cumulative Deaths per Million ($\delta = 1.2\%$)

Brazil

\[ R_0 = 1.3/1.0/1.1 \quad \delta = 0.012 \quad \theta = 0.1 \quad \gamma = 0.2 \quad \%\text{Infect} = 6/7/9 \]
Brazil: Daily Deaths per Million People ($\gamma = .2/.15$)

$R_0 = 1.3/1.1/1.1 \quad \delta = 0.010 \quad \alpha = 0.05 \quad \theta = 0.1 \quad \%\text{Infect} = 7/8/10$

DATA THROUGH 09-OCT-2020
Brazil: Cumulative Deaths per Million $\gamma = .2/.15$)

Brazil

$R_0=1.3/1.1/1.1$   $\delta = 0.010$   $\alpha=0.05$   $\theta=0.1$   %Infect= 7/8/10

DATA THROUGH 09-OCT-2020
Brazil: Daily Deaths per Million People ($\theta = .1/.07/.2$)

Brazil:

$R_0 = 1.3/1.1/1.1$  \( \delta = 0.010 \)  \( \alpha = 0.05 \)  \( \theta = 0.1 \)  \%Infect = 7/8/10

DATA THROUGH 09-OCT-2020
Brazil: Cumulative Deaths per Million People ($\theta = .1/.07/.2$)

Brazil

$R_0=1.3/1.1/1.1 \quad \delta = 0.010 \quad \alpha=0.05 \quad \theta=0.1 \quad \%\text{Infect}=7/8/10$

DATA THROUGH 09-OCT-2020

Cumulative deaths per million people

Data Underlying Estimates of Time-Varying $R_0$

– Inferred from daily deaths, and
– the change in daily deaths, and
– the change in (the change in daily deaths)
Brazil: Daily Deaths, Actual and Smoothed

Brazil: Daily deaths, \(d\)

\[\delta = 0.010 \quad \theta = 0.10 \quad \gamma = 0.20\]
Brazil: Change in (Change in Smoothed Daily Deaths)

Brazil: Delta (Delta d)

\[
\delta = 0.010 \quad \theta = 0.10 \quad \gamma = 0.20
\]