Estimating and Simulating a SIRD Model of COVID-19 for Many Countries, States, and Cities

Jesús Fernández-Villaverde and Chad Jones

Extended results for Kazakhstan
Based on data through August 24, 2020
Outline of Slides

- Basic data from Johns Hopkins CSSE (raw and smoothed)
- Brief summary of the model
- Baseline results ($\delta = 1.0\%, \gamma = 0.2, \theta = 0.1$)
- Simulation of re-opening – possibilities for raising $R_0$
- Results with alternative parameter values:
  - Lower mortality rate, $\delta = 0.8\%$
  - Higher mortality rate, $\delta = 1.2\%$
  - Infections last longer, $\gamma = 0.15$
  - Cases resolve more quickly, $\theta = 0.2$
  - Cases resolve more slowly, $\theta = 0.07$
- Data underlying estimates of $R_0(t)$
Underlying data from Johns Hopkins CSSE

- Raw data
- Smoothed = 7 day centered moving average
- No “excess deaths” correction (change as of Aug 6 run)
Kazakhstan: Daily Deaths per Million People

Kazakhstan

Daily deaths per million people

Apr May Jun Jul Aug

2020
Kazakhstan: Daily Deaths per Million People (Smoothed)
Brief Summary of Model

- See the paper for a full exposition
- A 5-state SIRDC model with a time-varying $R_0$

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parameter</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$\delta$</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
<td>Mortality rate from infections (IFR)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\gamma$</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>Rate at which people stop being infectious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\theta$</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>Rate at which cases (post-infection) resolve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\alpha$</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>Rate at which $R_0(t)$ decays with daily deaths</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$R_0$</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>Initial base reproduction rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$R_0(t)$</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>Base reproduction rate at date $t$ ($\beta_t/\gamma$)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Estimates of Time-Varying $R_0$

– Inferred from daily deaths, and
– the change in daily deaths, and
– the change in (the change in daily deaths)
(see end of slide deck for this data)
Kazakhstan: Estimates of $R_0(t)$

Kazakhstan

$\delta = 0.010 \quad \theta = 0.10 \quad \gamma = 0.20$
Kazakhstan: Percent Currently Infectious

Peak I/N = 0.10%  Final I/N = 0.04%  δ = 0.010  θ = 0.10  γ = 0.20
Kazakhstan: Growth Rate of Daily Deaths over Past Week (percent)

Kazakhstan

$\delta = 0.010 \quad \theta = 0.10 \quad \gamma = 0.20$
Notes on Interpreting Results
Guide to Graphs

- **Warning**: Results are often very uncertain; this can be seen by comparing across multiple graphs. See the original paper.

- **7 days of forecasts**: Rainbow color order!
  ROY-G-BIV (old to new, low to high)
  - Black = current
  - **Red** = oldest, **Orange** = second oldest, **Yellow** = third oldest...
  - **Violet** (purple) = one day earlier

- For robustness graphs, same idea
  - Black = baseline (e.g. $\delta = 1.0\%$)
  - **Red** = lowest parameter value (e.g. $\delta = 0.8\%$)
  - **Green** = highest parameter value (e.g. $\delta = 1.2\%$)
How does $R_0$ change over time?

- Inferred from death data when we have it
- For future, two approaches:

  1. Alternatively, we fit this equation:

     $$\log R_0(t) = a_0 - \alpha(Daily\ Deaths)$$

     $$\Rightarrow \alpha \approx 0.05$$

     $R_0$ declines by 5 percent for each new daily death, or rises by 5 percent when daily deaths decline

- Robustness: Assume $R_0(t) =$ final empirical value. Constant in future, so no $\alpha$ adjustment $\rightarrow \alpha = 0$
Repeated “Forecasts” from the past 7 days of data

– After peak, forecasts settle down.
– Before that, very noisy!
– If the region has not peaked, do not trust
– With $\alpha = .05$ (see robustness section for $\alpha = 0$)
Kazakhstan (7 days): Daily Deaths per Million People ($\alpha = .05$)

$R_0 = 1.3/0.6/0.7 \quad \delta = 0.010 \quad \alpha = 0.05 \quad \theta = 0.1 \quad \%\text{Infect} = 1/1/1$

DATA THROUGH 24-AUG-2020
Kazakhstan (7 days): Cumulative Deaths per Million (Future, $\alpha = .05$)

Kazakhstan
$R_0=1.3/0.6/0.7 \delta = 0.010 \alpha=0.05 \theta=0.1 \%Infect= 1/1/1$

DATA THROUGH 24-AUG-2020

Cumulative deaths per million people

Kazakhstan (7 days): Cumulative Deaths per Million, Log Scale ($\alpha = .05$)

Kazakhstan

$R_0=1.3/0.6/0.7 \quad \delta = 0.010 \quad \alpha=0.05 \quad \theta=0.1 \quad \%Infect=1/1/1$

Cumulative deaths per million people

New York City

Italy

Robustness to Mortality Rate, $\delta$
Kazakhstan: Cumulative Deaths per Million ($\delta = .01 / .008 / .012$)

Kazakhstan

$R_0=1.3/0.6/0.7 \ \delta = 0.010 \ \alpha=0.05 \ \theta=0.1 \ \%\text{Infect}=1/1/1$

DATA THROUGH 24-AUG-2020
Kazakhstan: Daily Deaths per Million People ($\delta = .01/.008/.012$)

Kazakhstan

$R_0 = 1.3/0.6/0.7 \quad \delta = 0.010 \quad \alpha = 0.05 \quad \theta = 0.1 \quad \%\text{Infect} = 1/1/1$

DATA THROUGH 24-AUG-2020
Kazakhstan: Cumulative Deaths per Million ($\delta = \text{.01/}\text{.008/}.012$)

Kazakhstan

$R_0 = 1.3/0.6/0.7$ $\delta = 0.010$ $\alpha = 0.05$ $\theta = 0.1$ $\%\text{Infect} = 1/1/1$

Cumulative deaths per million people

DATA THROUGH 24-AUG-2020

$\delta = 0.008$
Reopening and Herd Immunity

– **Black**: assumes $R_0$(today) remains in place forever
– **Red**: assumes $R_0$(suppress)$= 1/s(today)$
– **Green**: we move 25% of the way from $R_0$(today) back to initial $R_0 = “normal”$
– **Purple**: we move 50% of the way from $R_0$(today) back to initial $R_0 = “normal”$

**NOTE**: Lines often cover each other up
Kazakhstan: Re-Opening ($\alpha = .05$)

Kazakhstan

$R_0(t)=0.6$, $R_0(\text{suppress})=1.0$, $R_0(25/50)=1.0/1.3$, $\delta = 0.010$, $\alpha=0.05$
Kazakhstan: Re-Opening ($\alpha = 0$)

Kazakhstan

$R_0(t)=0.6$, $R_0(\text{suppress})=1.0$, $R_0(25/50)=1.0/1.3$, $\delta = 0.010$, $\alpha=0.00$
Results for alternative parameter values
Kazakhstan (7 days): Daily Deaths per Million People ($\alpha = 0$)

Kazakhstan

$R_0 = 1.3/0.6/0.6$ $\delta = 0.010$ $\alpha = 0.00$ $\theta = 0.1$ $%\text{Infect} = 1/1/1$

DATA THROUGH 24-AUG-2020

Daily deaths per million people
Kazakhstan (7 days): Cumulative Deaths per Million (Future, $\alpha = 0$)

Kazakhstan

$R_0 = 1.3/0.6/0.6$  $\delta = 0.010$  $\alpha = 0.00$  $\theta = 0.1$  $\%$Infect = 1/1/1

DATA THROUGH 24-AUG-2020
Kazakhstan (7 days): Cumulative Deaths per Million, Log Scale ($\alpha = 0$)

Kazakhstan

$R_0 = 1.3/0.6/0.6$  $\delta = 0.010$  $\alpha = 0.00$  $\theta = 0.1$  $\%$Infect = 1/1/1

New York City

Italy
Kazakhstan: Daily Deaths per Million People ($\delta = 0.8\%$)

Kazakhstan

$R_0=1.3/0.7/0.7 \quad \delta = 0.008 \quad \theta=0.1 \quad \gamma=0.2 \quad \%\text{Infect}= 1/1/1$
Kazakhstan: Cumulative Deaths per Million ($\delta = 0.8\%$)

Kazakhstan

$R_0=1.3/0.7/0.7 \quad \delta = 0.008 \quad \theta=0.1 \quad \gamma=0.2 \quad \%\text{Infect}=1/1/1$
Kazakhstan: Daily Deaths per Million People ($\delta = 1.2\%$)

Kazakhstan

$R_0=1.3/0.6/0.7 \quad \delta = 0.012 \quad \theta=0.1 \quad \gamma=0.2 \quad \%\text{Infect}= 1/1/1$
Kazakhstan: Cumulative Deaths per Million ($\delta = 1.2\%$)

Kazakhstan

$R_0 = 1.3/0.6/0.7 \quad \delta = 0.012 \quad \theta = 0.1 \quad \gamma = 0.2 \quad \%\text{Infect} = 1/1/1$
Kazakhstan: Daily Deaths per Million People ($\gamma = .2/.15$)

Kazakhstan

$R_0=1.3/0.6/0.7$  $\delta = 0.010$  $\alpha=0.05$  $\theta=0.1$  $\%$Infect= 1/1/1

DATA THROUGH 24-AUG-2020
Kazakhstan: Cumulative Deaths per Million $\gamma = .2/.15$)

Kazakhstan

$R_0=1.3/0.6/0.7\; \delta = 0.010\; \alpha=0.05\; \theta=0.1\; \%Infect= 1/1/1$

DATA THROUGH 24-AUG-2020

$\gamma = 0.25$
Kazakhstan: Daily Deaths per Million People ($\theta = .1/0.07/2$)

Kazakhstan

$R_0 = 1.3/0.6/0.7 \quad \delta = 0.010 \quad \alpha = 0.05 \quad \theta = 0.1 \quad \%\text{Infect} = 1/1/1$

DATA THROUGH 24-AUG-2020
Kazakhstan: Cumulative Deaths per Million People ($\theta = .1/.07/.2$)
Data Underlying Estimates of Time-Varying $R_0$

- Inferred from daily deaths, and
- the change in daily deaths, and
- the change in (the change in daily deaths)
Kazakhstan: Daily Deaths, Actual and Smoothed

Kazakhstan: Daily deaths, $d$

$\delta = 0.010 \quad \theta = 0.10 \quad \gamma = 0.20$
Kazakhstan: Change in Smoothed Daily Deaths

Kazakhstan: Delta $d$

$\delta = 0.010 \quad \theta = 0.10 \quad \gamma = 0.20$
Kazakhstan: Change in (Change in Smoothed Daily Deaths)

Kazakhstan: Delta (Delta d)

$\delta = 0.010 \quad \theta = 0.10 \quad \gamma = 0.20$