Designing for Deliberation

Todd Davies
Symbolic Systems Program
Stanford University

People, Computers, and Design Seminar
January 20, 2006

"Deliberation"

- "thoughtful, careful, or lengthy consideration" by individuals

- "formal discussion and debate" in groups

Models of online deliberation

- Citizen dialogue – formation of public opinion
- Public consultation – citizen input as part of an official process online
- Collective decision making – group democracy, egalitarian power
- Community organizing – loose group with shared interests, guided by organizers
- Managed, cooperative work – deliberation as an aspect of business/formal organizations
- Group learning – educational settings

"Online deliberation"

A common theme:

The challenge of using electronic media in a way that deepens thinking and improves mutual understanding.

See also:

http://www.online-deliberation.net

PIECE

Partnership for

- Internet Equity

and

- Community Engagement

between…

- the East Palo Alto Community Network

and

- the Symbolic Systems Program at Stanford

Ideals of the PIECE approach

- Community-based

- Participant-observation

- Problem-driven

A Problem-Driven Design Process

- Problems Identified
- Other Observations and Assumptions
- Available Approaches
- Principles
- Consequences
- Initial design and feedback
- Re-design

QuickTime and a
H.263 decompressor
are needed to see this picture.

Participant observations in East Palo Alto (2002-2003)

Problems posed by reliance on f2f meetings for community decision making:

- Low attendance and representation
- Insufficient meeting duration and frequency
- Not enough communication between meetings
- Not enough information available during meetings
- Not enough communication between groups
- Insufficient (access to) group records
- Streamlined decision procedures
- Lack of transparency for those unable to attend
- Present in all communities, but of amplified importance in underserved communities

Other Observations and Assumptions

- Email use universal in some, technology-oriented groups (e.g. TechCollab)
- Other tools being used: Yahoo! Groups, Zoomerang
- Many residents in non-tech oriented groups did not use email
- Community Network making Internet access nearly universal, with training opportunities
- Language and literacy barriers can be overcome through representation
- Decision making thought to require face-to-face meetings

Available Approaches

- Making more effective use of existing asynchronous tools for threaded text conversation (email, message boards, blogs, wikis)

- Synchronous tools (e.g. voice chat software used by Fishkin/Luskin), combined with email

- Better publicity for and public records of f2f meetings

- New asynchronous tool for deliberation tailored to target groups

Deme: a platform for online deliberation (2003-)

Principles:

- **Supportiveness**. The platform should support the group overall, so that there is either an improvement or no decline in the ability of the group to meet the needs of its members or stakeholders.

Deme: a platform for online deliberation (2003-)

Principles:

- ***Supportiveness***
- ***Comprehensiveness.*** The platform should allow the group to accomplish, in an online environment, all of the usual deliberative tasks associated with face-to-face meetings.

Deme: a platform for online deliberation (2003-)

Principles:

- ***Supportiveness***
- ***Comprehensiveness***
- ***Participation.*** The platform should maximize the number of desired participants in the group's deliberations, and minimize barriers to their participation.

Deme: a platform for online deliberation (2003-)

Principles:

- ***Supportiveness***
- ***Comprehensiveness***
- ***Participation***
- ***Quality.*** The platform should facilitate a subjective quality of interaction and decision making that meets or exceeds what the group achieves in face-to-face meetings

Principle 1:
Supporting the Group

Consequences:

- Sovereign control
- Free and open source
- Integrate with existing practices (e.g. decision procedures, email list, other tools)
- Responsiveness of designers

Principle 2:
Comprehensive Deliberation

Consequences:

- Discussion focused on agenda items
- Shared display (WYSIWIS)
- Flexible polls and decisions
- In-text comments in documents
- Document revision
- Project management tool integrated witih discussion
- Customizable group website/archive
- Flexible integration with email
- Multiple meeting areas per group space
- Ability to share meeting areas across groups

Principle 3:
Maximizing Desired Participants

Consequences:

- Asynchronous (different times/places)
- Compatible and interoperable
- Familiar features
- Simple, intuitive design
- Accessibility to those with special needs
- Fast, robust, secure

Principle 4:
High Quality Deliberation

Consequences:

- Built-in feedback

- Proven structures for discussion

- Tutorials/models of practice

- Features that encourage directed discussion rather than paraphrasing

Present version of Deme (v0.5)

Live Demo….

(see at groupspace.org)

Demo Group

DEME version is 0.5.0

This is the description of the group, which can be edited by anyone with access to the group. In this case, you are in the Demo Group, which is meant as an interactive introduction to Deme and its features.

[Edit this summary]

Welcome, **todd**   :::**my settings**   :::**logout**   :::**my groups**

Meeting Areas

- Learn Deme Here
- Sandbox
- Deme Discussion
- mymeetingname
- RM Players
- testi testi
- Discussion
- Members assembly
- Eureka!
- Puppu
- The Cybernetics of on-line deliberation

  Create new meeting area...

Announcements

- Jan-14: test
- Dec-29: Test2
- Nov-29: This is a short announcement.
- Sep-17: Test
- Mar-15: Welcome to the Demo Group! Click the "Learn Deme Here" meeting area link on the left to get an introduction to meeting area features.

View all announcements

Add new announcement

General Options

- My profile
- Member List
- Calendar
- Links
- Library
- FAQ (Frequently Asked Questions)
- Search
- Chat
- Leave this group

This site uses **DEME** software.

Done

Groupspace: **My Groups** > **Demo Group** > **Learn Deme Here**

Logged in as **todd**

Turn help off | logout | my groups

This item: **3. Example: Document** ▾

<- **To item index**   --- select an action --- ▾

3. Example: Document [Document]

> **Preface:**
> This is an example of a document, and you are reading the "preface" of the document. Read the document below for more information about documents, and, if you like, you can post a comment on this document.
>
> Document posted by: **andrew** , Feb 02, 17:21

General comments on this document:

New document announcement

Example of a general comment on a document

 A document can be anything that contains text you want people to read. It is possible to post and view documents other than plain text ones (e.g. pictures, Word documents, video clips), but currently only plain text documents support in-text commenting (explaination of in-text commenting will follow shortly). But there are many possible documents that can be posted in a meeting area even now. A document could be the proposed bylaws of your group, a press release you are drafting together, an interesting article you want everyone to read, or something else, as long as it is in text form.

 Deme was designed to support document collaboration, document-centered discussion, and decision making about *[Example of an in-text comment -andrew]* documents. "Document collaboration" means that two or more people work together to draft and/or revise a document. In the action menu (the pulldown menu filled in light blue) you can always select "New document" to post a document from scratch. When you are currently viewing a document in the folio viewer's item display, the action menu will also contain an option for

Global comment | Sort comments by: **item** subject date author

3. Example: Document Example of an in-text comment - **andrew** - Feb 0...
3. Example: Document Example comment - **todd** - Feb 22, 16:59
3. Example: Document No comments on comments? - **guest** - Jun 14, 1

4. Example: Decision New Poll: "Example: Decision" - **andrew** - Feb 02,
Vote Has Closed - - Jan 13, 14:05

3.1. Example: Document New Document: "Example: Document" - **andrew** -

5. Example: Link Link: "Example: Link" - **andrew** - Feb 02, 17:38

6. Example: Project Project: "Example: Project" - **andrew** - Feb 02, 17:41
6.a. Task: "Example: Task" - **andrew** - Feb 02, 17:48
6.b. Task: "Example: Task Handler" - **andrew** - Feb 02, 17:52

3. Example: Document   **andrew**   prev next

Message #: 7

Comment: *Example of an in-text comment* -
Feb 02, 17:26

[Respond to this comment]

I am inserting this comment into the text of "Example: Document", in between the words "about" and "documents." I don't have anything particularly to say about these words, or the surrounding context, other than to show that an "in-text" comment like this can be placed anywhere in the text of a document. This is done via the "Comment on item" feature selected from the action menu when a document is loaded into the folio viewer.

Notice that, when you click on the item reference for this comment (the underlined first part of its header) the folio

Done

Groupspace: **My Groups** > **Demo Group** > **Learn Deme Here**

Logged in as **todd**
Turn help off | logout | my groups

This item: [4. Example: Decision ▼] ☐

<- To item index [--- select an action --- ▼]

Example: Decision [Decision]

Question: Let's try to make a decision. The decision concerns whether the text of 'Example: Document' is sufficient as an overview of how documents function in a meeting area. Click 'Vote now' to make your choice known, and note that you can annotate your vote with a comment. I have selected 'consensus' as the decision rule, meaning that everyone has to agree for this proposal to pass.

Decision called for by: **andrew** , Feb 02, 17:31
Announcement Message

Voting has closed.   *Closing message*

Choices	Total votes
Approve "Example: Document"	1
Don't Approve "Example: Document"	1

Member choices/comments:

Approve "Example: Document"

andrew   Feb-02, 17:32

I agree with the current state of "Example: Document"

Don't Approve "Example: Document"

guest   Jul-05, 07:05

Just to see what happens.

Did not vote:

Global comment | Sort comments by: **item** subject date author

3. Example: Document Example of an in-text comment - **andrew** - Feb 02, 1
3. Example: Document Example comment - **todd** - Feb 22, 16:59
3. Example: Document No comments on comments? - **guest** - Jun 14, 1

4. Example: Decision New Poll: "Example: Decision" - **andrew** - Feb 02,
Vote Has Closed - - Jan 13, 14:05

3.1. Example: Document New Document: "Example: Document" - **andrew** -

5. Example: Link Link: "Example: Link" - **andrew** - Feb 02, 17:38

6. Example: Project Project: "Example: Project" - **andrew** - Feb 02, 17:41
6.a. Task: "Example: Task" - **andrew** - Feb 02, 17:48
6.b. Task: "Example: Task Handler" - **andrew** - Feb 02, 17:52

---

4. Example: Decision   **andrew**   prev next

Message #: 8

Comment: *New Poll: "Example: Decision"* -
Feb 02, 17:31

[Respond to this comment]

Let's try to make a decision. The decision concerns whether the text of 'Example: Document' is sufficient as an overview of how documents function in a meeting area. Click 'Vote now' to make your choice known, and note that you can annotate your vote with a comment. I have selected 'consensus' as the decision rule, meaning that everyone has to agree for this proposal to pass.

Done

File   Edit   View   Favorites   Tools   Help

Address about:blank   → Go   Links »

General Dev and Design
General@Development.Groupspace.org

Logged in as **aarontam**
my groups | logout

Item View   **Combined View**   **Discussion View**

Goto ▼   Actions ▼   New Comment   Find   Collapsed ▼

↑ **Index**   ↑ **Top**

19. Goals [Document]

↑ Comments | Expand all | Collapse all

📄 New Document: "Goals" - todd - Oct 01, 15:16
📄 Virus checking? - todd - Oct 11, 16:02
📄 Presence detection - todd - Oct 11, 16:04

Preface:
Here's the list from my whiteboard last night - feel free to comment/revise/add more. I've added a few things.

Document posted by: **todd** , Oct 01, 15:16

General comments on this document:
New document announcement

Some Deme Project Goals for 2004-2005 (not complete)

Email integration (posting) - Brendan and Andrew
Bug/tweak list (item 4. Deme 0.5) - Alex and Andrew
New stuff for users - Todd, plus others as needed for coding
 Documentation/website
 Friendliness - new tooltips, labels
 Aesthetics
Outreach to developers, funders, users, stakeholders - Todd +
 Deme development workshop
 New funding proposal for Haas
 Grant proposal for outside funding
Academic outreach - Todd +
 Conference in March/April
 Revise white paper, publish
Other design goals
 Novice/infrequent user vs Experienced/frequent user modes
 Reformat indexes, display by relevance
 Better cross-referencing interface and appropriate same-window placement
 Sectioning items/discussion
 Better organization and editability of item index
 Wiki-like editing/comments keyed to versions in header
 Better priv/customizability [look/feel options -todd]
 Code cleaning/rewriting
 [Virus checking? -todd]
 [Implement poll/survey -todd] [Member participation statistics -todd] [Presence detection -todd]

Link to this item

debugging...
See raw docrefd text
See orig text

Comment: **Presence detection** - Oct 11, 16:04

Would be very useful at some point, especially if profiles had links to IM addresses.

Respond to this comment

Link to this message

📄 Member participation statistics - todd - Oct 11, 16:07
📄 Implement poll/survey - todd - Oct 11, 16:41
📄 look/feel options - todd - Oct 12, 21:06

New Comment

Meeting Area Members

👁 **Online (3)**

👤 aarontam ▲
👤 newmanb
👤 todd

Chat 👥

aarontam joins the chat.

aarontam says to all: hi!

todd says to all: hi hows it going?

newmanb says to all: pretty good.

Start Chatting

hide chat »

⊞ Group Options

My Settings
Member List
Calendar
Links
FAQ
Library
Bulk Subscribe
Email Options
Meeting Areas
Homepage

<< hide options

Groupspace.org

deme v0.6

Done   Internet

🏁 start   about:blank - Microso...   2:43 PM

Group Homepage ⠿

Development
Development.Groupspace.org

Logged in as **aarontam**
my groups | logout

Groupspace.org
↳My Groups
  ↳Development

⠿Group Options

My Settings
Member List
Calendar
Links
FAQ
Library
Bulk Subscribe
Email Options
Meeting Areas
▶Homepage

<< hide options

Meeting Areas 🛋

Create new meeting area

1. **General**
   (15 posts since 09/25) | Info ⓘ

2. **New Meeting Area**
   (7 posts in last 2 hours) | Info ⓘ

3. **Testing New Name**
   (9 posts in last 3 days) | Info ⓘ

4. **New Marea**
   (2 posts in last 23 min) | Info ⓘ

      .
      .
      .
      .
      .
      .

[more]

group image file here

This is the general development area. Feel free to post any questions or comments you may have. Also, feel free to posit suggestions and advice for the layout.
[Edit this description]

Announcements 📋

[Add Announcement]

[06/24/05 12:05PM] by **aarontam**
Action: [Edit] [Delete]
This is a test announcement. There will be many more announcements in the future.

      .
      .
      .
      .
      .
      .
      .

[more]

Group Members

👁 **Online (3)**

👤 aarontam ▲
👤 newmanb
👤 todd   ▼

Chat 👥

aarontam joins the chat.   ▲

aarontam says to all: hi!

todd says to all: hi hows it going?

newmanb says to all: pretty good.   ▼

Start Chatting

hide chat >>

Groupspace.org

deme v0.6

Groups that could benefit…

- Volunteer advisory boards
- Neighborhood associations
- Consortia of nonprofits
- Grassroots activist groups
- Labor union chapters and caucuses
- Clubs and religious congregations
- University-based groups
- Ad-hoc citizen groups (e.g. for community planning)

PIECE Contributors (2002-)

Kim Karen Chen
Alex Angiolillo Cochran
Todd Davies
Magda Escobar
Jonathan J. Effrat
Roma Jhaveri
Christina Mills
Benjamin Newman
Brendan O'Connor
Andrew Parker
Gautam Raghavan
Randy Saffold
Renata Danielle Sanchez
Benjamin Sywulka
Aaron Tam
Brandi Thompson
Tom Wasow
Rolando Zeledon

For more info…

On this project…

- www.groupspace.org (Deme host) - see FAQ
- http://piece.stanford.edu (PIECE project)

HCI Background:

- Stefik et al., "Beyond the Chalkboard" (1987) -- WYSIWIS
- Holland & Stornetta, "Beyond Being There" (1992) - f2f not necessarily gold standard
- Grudin, "Groupware and Social Dynamics: Eight Challenges for Developers" (1994)
- Mashayekhi et al., "AISA" (1995) - visual indicators of focus
- Kruger & Cross, "Modeling Cognitive Strategies in Creative Design" (2001) - problem-driven vs solution-driven design